WHAT IS THE END GOAL?

Professionalism or Professional Identity?

Yvonne Steinert, Ph.D., C.M.
Institute of Health Sciences Education
Faculty of Medicine
McGill University
DISCLOSURE OF FINANCIAL RELATIONSHIPS

• Yvonne Steinert has no relevant financial relationships with a commercial interest pertaining to the content of this presentation.

• Kristin Janke has no relevant financial relationships with a commercial interest pertaining to the content of this presentation.
SESSION GOALS

• To distinguish between professionalism and professional identity formation

• To discuss whether professional identity formation should be the overarching goal in developing health professionals

• To describe how pharmacy educators can support students’ professional identity formation in their own contexts

• To discuss pharmacy education’s path forward…
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Many thanks to Drs. Richard and Sylvia Cruess, with whom many of these materials have been developed...
BY WAY OF INTRODUCTION...
WHAT IS THE END GOAL?

A. Professionalism
B. Professional identity
C. All of the above
D. None of the above
CASE VIGNETTE – I

In order to gain early patient care experience, students work with families during their first year of the program. While riding on an elevator in the hospital, one student hears another discussing his assigned family by name and in derogatory terms.

What would you do?
What attributes of professionalism are illustrated here?
TO CONSIDER

• Do you currently teach professionalism? If so, how?
• Do you have a definition of professionalism? If so, what is it?
• What educational challenges do you encounter?
EDUCATIONAL CHALLENGES

• Agreeing on a definition
• Being professional
• Imparting knowledge of professionalism to learners and faculty members
• Encouraging behaviors characteristic of the professional
• Changing the institutional culture
• Being mindful of cross-cultural differences
A DEFINITION OF “PROFESSIONALISM”

“A set of values, behaviors, and relationships that underpin the trust that the public has in doctors…”
Royal College of Physicians of London, 2005

“The active demonstration of the traits of a professional.”
White Paper on Pharmacy Student Professionalism, 1999
THE TRAITS OF A PROFESSIONAL

• Knowledge of the skills of a profession
• Commitment to self-improvement of skills and knowledge
• Service orientation
• Pride in the profession
• Covenantal relationship with the client
• Creativity and innovation
• Conscience and trustworthiness
• Accountability for one’s work
• Ethically sound decision-making
• Leadership

White Paper on Pharmacy Student Professionalism, 1999
TEACHING PROFESSIONALISM

Two Approaches:

• Teach it explicitly (e.g., focus on behaviors & traits)
  • This can become too theoretical

• Teach it as a moral endeavour (e.g., experiential learning)
  • This can become selective and disorganized

WE MUST DO BOTH!
SUCCESS IN TEACHING PROFESSIONALISM

A *faculty perspective*:
- Curricula have been developed
- The teaching of professionalism has been widely adopted

A *learner perspective*:
- Learners recognize the importance of professionalism
- Learners develop an understanding of the cognitive base – and the professional behaviors – expected of them
- Learners acquire a framework to help interpret clinical experiences
CHALLENGES IN TEACHING PROFESSIONALISM

A faculty perspective:
• Teaching professionalism does not always lead to the adoption of professional behaviors
• There tends to be an over-reliance on promoting professional behaviors rather than on who the individual is

A learner perspective:
• The cognitive base is often taught in isolation
• Complex content is often oversimplified
• There is a focus on negative professionalism
The teaching of medical professionalism is not an end in itself, but a means to an end.

The end, and the educational objective, is to ensure that every individual entering practice has acquired a professional identity so that they can “think, act, and feel like a physician.”

Cruess, Cruess, Boudreau, Snell & Steinert, 2015
THE NEED FOR CHANGE, CONT’D…

• As teachers and educators we need to ensure that our graduates have acquired a professional identity…
  • *We should not just focus on ‘doing’, but also on ‘being’*…

• A professional identity is one of the main outcomes we want from a graduate; it is the basis of all decisions we make as professionals…
  • *And what is expected by patients, society and peers*…

Snell, 2020
A FUNDAMENTAL QUESTION

Does medical practice require “a professional presence that is best grounded in what one is rather than what one does?”

Hafferty, 2009
FROM PROFESSIONALISM TO IDENTITY
FROM PROFESSIONALISM TO IDENTITY

• Professional identity formation takes place through a process of socialization

• This process can be made more effective by:
  • Understanding the nature of identity formation
  • Being specific about the professional identity to be created
  • Understanding socialization
DEFINING KEY CONCEPTS...

The singer had good diction.

A reference book contains words with information and etymology.

1. A book containing one language translated words.

2. A book containing both words and music.
IDENTITY

“A set of characteristics or a description that distinguishes a person or things from others.”

Oxford English Dictionary
MEDICAL PROFESSIONAL IDENTITY

A representation of self, achieved in stages over time during which the characteristics, values, and norms of the medical profession are internalized, resulting in an individual thinking, acting and feeling like a physician.

Cruess, Cruess, Boudreau, Snell & Steinert, 2014
THE BENEFITS OF A FOCUS ON IDENTITY

Identity helps us to:
• Explain ourselves
• Present ourselves
• Conduct ourselves
• Identify the scope and nature of our work
• Define what’s important
• Organize our time

Cantillon, 2019
BUT REMEMBER...

• Identity is complex
• Individuals have several identities – personal and professional
• Identities can change

Identities represent who we are at any one point in time.
SOCIALIZATION

• The process by which a person learns to function within a particular society or group by internalizing its values and norms (Oxford English Dictionary)

• The process by which people selectively acquire the values and attitudes, the interests and knowledge current in the groups of which they are – or seek to – become a member (Merton et al., 1957)
THE PROCESS OF BECOMING A PHYSICIAN

Existing personal identities
“Who you are”
- Genes
- Sex/Race
- Personal characteristics

Experiences
- Religion/Culture
- Class
- Education
- Sexual orientation
- Other

Socialization
- Negotiation
- Acceptance
- Compromise
- Rejection

New personal & professional identities
“Who you become”

Student → Resident → Physician

Legitimate peripheral participation
Community of practice
Social interaction
Full participation

Cruess, Cruess, Boudreau, Snell & Steinert, 2015
WHAT FACTORS INFLUENCE PROFESSIONAL IDENTITY FORMATION?
Professional identity arises “from a long term combination of experience & reflection on experience.”

Hilton & Slotnick, 2005
SUPPORTING PROFESSIONAL IDENTITY FORMATION

• Create a safe and welcoming environment
• Identify clear learning outcomes related to identity formation
• **Be explicit about the values and behaviors underpinning professional identity.**
• Enable authentic experiential learning
• Facilitate meaningful relationships
• Promote guided reflection
• Provide ongoing – and constructive – feedback
SUPPORTING PROFESSIONAL IDENTITY FORMATION

• Decrease the emphasis on lapses
• Focus on supporting positive development
• Include – and empower – learners in the process
• Focus on transitions
• Invest in faculty development

Photo Credit: Union University College of Pharmacy via AACP
LINKING TEACHING TO ASSESSMENT

Miller’s pyramid has greatly influenced the assessment literature and has helped us to conceptualize our thinking – and our approaches – at multiple levels...
Knows when individual behaviors are appropriate

Demonstrates the behaviors expected of a physician under supervision

KNOWS HOW competence

SHOWS HOW performance

DOES action

IS identity

Consistently demonstrates the values, attitudes and behaviors expected of one who has come to “think, act, and feel” like a physician

KNOWS knowledge

Knows the behavioral norms expected of a physician

Knows when individual behaviors are appropriate

Demonstrates the behaviors expected of a physician under supervision

KNOWS HOW competence

SHOWS HOW performance

DOES action

IS identity
METHODS FOR ASSESSING PROFESSIONALISM

• Direct observations in workplace settings
• Clinical evaluation exercises
• Objective structured clinical examinations
• Video and/or audio assessments
• Multi-source feedback
• Critical incident analysis
ASSESSING PROFESSIONAL IDENTITY FORMATION

• **In Medicine:**
  • Learning logs (Niemi, 1997)
  • Identity status interviews (Niemi, 1997)
  • Professional self-identity questionnaires (Crossley & Vivekananda-Schmidt, 2009)

• **In other fields:**
  • Standardized inventories (e.g. Professional Role Orientation Inventory)
  • Open-ended interviews (Bebeau et al., 2012)
  • Open essays (Bebeau et al., 2012)
CASE STUDY I:

AN UNDERGRADUATE PROGRAM TO SUPPORT LEARNERS’ IDENTITY FORMATION
PHYSICIANSHIP AT MCGILL

• A conceptual anchor for the undergraduate program at McGill – throughout the 4-year curriculum
• Focuses on the dual roles of the physician: as healer and as professional
• Includes a course called *Physician Apprenticeship*
  • Assists students in their transition from layperson to physician
  • Provides a supportive environment to discuss important issues
  • Promotes self-reflection
APPRENTICESHIP STRUCTURE

• 1 teacher/mentor (called an ‘Osler Fellow’) with 5 to 6 students
• 1-2 senior students (who act as co-leaders)
• One group meeting every two months, supplemented by occasional one-on-one meetings
• Additional activities
  • Visits to a patient at home
  • Visits to a patient in a Palliative Care Unit
  • Interviews with standardized patients at a Simulation Centre
  • Participation in the ‘White Coat Ceremony’
PROGRAM EVALUATION

Students and Osler Fellows value:
• The creation of a “safe space”
• An opportunity to reflect
• The nature of their relationship
• The chance to talk about identity

This is one of the few places where you can pause and reflect on what this process is doing to you...

Looking through the students’ eyes I can remember why I chose to be a doctor...
CASE STUDY II:

A FACULTY DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM TO HELP FOSTER PROFESSIONALISM & PROFESSIONAL IDENTITY FORMATION
FACULTY DEVELOPMENT

... Refers to all activities health professionals pursue to improve their knowledge, skills and behaviours as teachers and educators, leaders and managers, researchers and scholars in both individual and group settings.
FACULTY DEVELOPMENT OFFERINGS AT MCGILL

• Teaching Professionalism
• Supporting Professional Identity Formation
• Effective Role Modelling
• Creating a Safe Learning Environment
SUPPORTING PROFESSIONAL IDENTITY FORMATION

Objectives:
• Define identity and professional identity formation
• Reflect on personal and professional identities and their formation
• Describe the process of socialization and key influencing factors
• Design education strategies that positively influence these factors

Format:
• Workshop including large group interactive plenary, individual exercises and small group discussions
WHAT IS THE END GOAL?

A. Professionalism
B. Professional identity
C. All of the above
D. None of the above
IN CLOSING...

• Consider reframing the teaching of professionalism to focus on professional identity formation
  • Build on current educational programs
  • Remember that the attributes of professionalism constitute the norms of the desired identity

• Make the focus on identity formation explicit
  • Be explicit about the desired professional identity
  • Pay particular attention to identity formation during moments of transition

• Promote guided reflection and reflective practice
IN CLOSING...

• Work to influence the socialization process
• Engage learners in the process – and empower them to take an active role in their own formation
• Consider the critical role of work-based learning and communities of practice in identity formation
• Ensure institutional support
• Make faculty development a priority
THANK YOU!

yvonne.steinert@mcgill.ca
Thoughts on Moving Forward for Pharmacy Education

Kristin Kari Janke, Ph.D.
Chair, 2020-2021 AACP Student Affairs Committee
Professor, Pharmaceutical Care & Health Systems
Director, Wulling Center for Innovation & Scholarship in Pharmacy Education
Senior Associate to the Dean, Assessment & Quality
University of Minnesota College of Pharmacy
Dr. Steinert’s Advice

This process of identity formation can be made more effective by:

• Understanding the nature of identity formation
• Being specific about the professional identity to be created
• Understanding socialization
AACP encourages colleges and schools of pharmacy to advance education that is aimed at the *intentional* formation of professional identity (i.e. thinking, feeling and acting like a pharmacist) and developed and implemented in cooperation with professional pharmacy organizations within the broader pharmacy profession.

(Emphasis mine), AACP House of Delegates, 2020
Our Current Efforts (AACP SAC, 2020-2021)

• Identifying relevant educational theories
  • Identifying objectives, teaching/learning methods and assessments

• Making faculty development a priority

• Ensuring institutional support

• Being explicit about the values and behaviors underpinning the professional identity
Learning environment

Health care system

Existing personal identities

Family & friends

Interactions with peers

Formal teaching & assessment

Role models & mentors

Conscious reflection

Unconscious acquisition

Conscious reflection

Unconscious acquisition

Clinical experiences with patients

Self-assessment

New personal & professional identities

Symbols & rituals

Interactions with patients, peers, health care professionals, public
Educators Helping Learners To...

• Navigate transitions
• Learn the language
• Learn to live with ambiguity
• Learn the hierarchy and power relationships
• Learn to "play the role"
• Integrate personal and professional identities
• Manage emotions (e.g. anxiety, frustration, satisfaction)
Extending Our Current Efforts as Educators

• Build on our professionalism work
• Support socialization and communities of practice
• Recognize the importance of identity, especially in practice transformation
  • How we explain, present and conduct ourselves
  • Identify the scope and nature of our work
  • Define what’s important
  • Organize our time (Cantillon, 2019)
Questions